

Appendix D



Historic Resources Report,
Archaeological Resources Report, and
Paleontological Resources Report

Appendix D-1



Baldwin Hills Crenshaw Plaza Historic
Resource Report

BALDWIN HILLS CRENSHAW PLAZA

Historic Resource Report



Christopher A. Joseph & Associates
11849 W. Olympic Blvd., Suite 101
Los Angeles, CA 90064

July 2009

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Purpose and Qualifications

The purpose of this report is to determine whether or not a proposed development project (sometimes referred to as “the Project”) in the Baldwin Hills area of the City of Los Angeles will impact historic resources. The Project involves the redevelopment of the Baldwin Hills Crenshaw Plaza. The mixed-use project will include, retail, commercial, office, hotel, and residential uses totaling up to approximately 3,501,00 square feet of developed floor area, which will be constructed in phases. The existing mall site is developed with approximately 1,000,000 square feet of retail, restaurant, office, and entertainment uses, including two department store buildings that will be incorporated into the Project.

Teresa Grimes was responsible for the preparation of this report. Ms. Grimes, Senior Architectural Historian for Christopher A. Joseph & Associates has nearly 20 years of experience in the field of historic preservation and a M.A. in Architecture. She more than fulfills the qualifications for historic preservation professionals outlined in Title 36 of the Code of Federal Regulations, Part 61.

1.2 Methodology

In preparing the report, the following tasks were performed:

1. A field inspection was conducted of the Project site and surrounding area to determine the scope of the study. Digital photographs were taken at this time.
2. The Project site was researched to determine whether or not any of the buildings thereon, or in the vicinity, are currently listed as landmarks at the national, state, or local levels and whether or not they have been previously evaluated as historic resources. The California Historical Resources Inventory System (CHRIS) includes properties listed and determined eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places, listed and determined eligible for listing in the California Register of Historical Resources, California Registered Historical Landmarks and Points of Historical Interest, as well as properties that have been evaluated in historic resource surveys and other planning activities. Two buildings on the Project site are included in CHRIS: the former May Company Department Store has a status code of 2S2 and the former Broadway Department Store has a status code of 3S. A status code of 2S2 means that the building has been formally determined eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places, while a status code of 3S means that the building appears to be eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.
3. As no identified or potential historic resources were identified in the vicinity of the Project site, the study area was identified as the Project site itself. The only two buildings on the Project site that are identified or potential historic resources are the former May Company and Broadway Department Stores. No other buildings on the Project site were identified for further study as potential historic resources due to a lack of age, physical integrity, or architectural distinction.
4. Intensive research was conducted on the history of the Broadway-Crenshaw Center as well as the former Broadway and May Company Department Stores, to establish what

it looked like originally and how it has evolved. Sources consulted included City of Los Angeles building permit records, County of Los Angeles Tax Assessor records, Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps, and historic photograph collections at the Los Angeles Public Library.

5. The Project site was not analyzed as a potential historic district because all of the original buildings from the Broadway-Crenshaw Center have been demolished, with the exception of the Broadway Department Store.
6. Reviewed and analyzed ordinances, statutes, regulations, bulletins, and technical materials relating to federal, state, and local historic preservation designations, and assessment processes and programs.

2. REGULATORY ENVIRONMENT

2.1 Regulatory Environment

Generally, a lead agency must consider a property a historic resource under the California Environmental Quality Act if it is eligible for listing in the California Register of Historical Resources (California Register). The California Register is modeled after the National Register of Historic Places (National Register). Furthermore, a property is presumed to be historically significant if it is listed in a local register of historic resources or has been identified as historically significant in a historic resources survey (provided certain criteria and requirements are satisfied) unless a preponderance of evidence demonstrates that the property is not historically or culturally significant.¹ The National and California Register designation programs are discussed below.

National Register of Historic Places

The National Register is "an authoritative guide to be used by federal, state, and local governments, private groups and citizens to identify the nation's cultural resources and to indicate what properties should be considered for protection from destruction or impairment."²

Criteria

To be eligible for listing in the National Register, a property must be at least 50 years of age and possess significance in American history and culture, architecture, or archaeology. A property of potential significance must meet one or more of four established criteria:³

- A. Associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or
- B. Associated with the lives of persons significant in our past; or
- C. Embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that

¹ Public Resources Code Section 5024.1 and 14 CCR Section 4850.

² Title 36 Code of Federal Regulations Part 60.2.

³ Title 36 Code of Federal Regulations Part 60.4.

represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or

- D. Yield, or may be likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history.

Physical Integrity

According to *National Register Bulletin #15*, "to be eligible for listing in the National Register, a property must not only be shown to be significant under National Register criteria, but it also must have integrity." Integrity is defined in *National Register Bulletin #15* as "the ability of a property to convey its significance."⁴ Within the concept of integrity, the National Register recognizes seven aspects or qualities that in various combinations define integrity. They are feeling, association, workmanship, location, design, setting, and materials.

Context

To be eligible for listing in the National Register, a property must also be significant within a historic context. *National Register Bulletin #15* states that the significance of a historic property can be judged only when it is evaluated within its historic context. Historic contexts are "those patterns, themes, or trends in history by which a specific...property or site is understood and its meaning...is made clear."⁵ A property must represent an important aspect of the area's history or prehistory and possess the requisite integrity to qualify for the National Register.

California Register of Historical Resources

In 1992, Governor Wilson signed Assembly Bill 2881 into law establishing the California Register. The California Register is an authoritative guide used by state and local agencies, private groups and citizens to identify historic resources and to indicate what properties are to be protected, to the extent prudent and feasible, from substantial adverse impacts.

The California Register consists of properties that are listed automatically as well as those that must be nominated through an application and public hearing process.⁶ The California Register automatically includes the following:

- California properties listed in the National Register and those formally Determined Eligible for the National Register;
- California Registered Historical Landmarks from No. 0770 onward; and
- Those California Points of Historical Interest that have been evaluated by the Office of Historic Preservation (OHP) and have been recommended to the State Historical Resources Commission for inclusion on the California Register.

The criteria for eligibility of listing in the California Register are based upon National Register criteria, but are identified as 1-4 instead of A-D. To be eligible for listing in the California Register, a property must be at least 50 years of age and possess significance at the local, state, or national level, under one or more of the following four criteria:

⁴ *National Register Bulletin #15*, pp. 44-45.

1. It is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of local or regional history, or the cultural heritage of California or the United States; or
2. It is associated with the lives of persons important to local, California, or national history; or
3. It embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values; or
4. It has yielded, or has the potential to yield, information important in the prehistory or history of the local area, California, or the nation.

Historic resources eligible for listing in the California Register may include buildings, sites, structures, objects, and historic districts. Resources less than 50 years of age may be eligible if it can be demonstrated that sufficient time has passed to understand its historical importance. While the enabling legislation for the California Register is less rigorous with regard to the issue of integrity, there is the expectation that properties reflect their appearance during their period of significance.⁷

The California Register may also include properties identified during historic resource surveys. However, the survey must meet all of the following criteria:⁸

1. The survey has been or will be included in the State Historic Resources Inventory.
2. The survey and the survey documentation were prepared in accordance with office [SOHP] procedures and requirements.
3. The resource is evaluated and determined by the office [SOHP] to have a significance rating of Category 1 to 5 on a DPR Form 523.
4. If the survey is five or more years old at the time of its nomination for inclusion in the California Register, the survey is updated to identify historical resources which have become eligible or ineligible due to changed circumstances or further documentation and those which have been demolished or altered in a manner that substantially diminishes the significance of the resource.

OHP Survey Methodology

The evaluation instructions and classification system proscribed by OHP in its *Instructions for Recording Historical Resources* provide a three-digit evaluation code for use in classifying potential historic resources. In 2003, the codes were revised to address the California Register. The first digit indicates the general category of evaluation. The second digit is a letter code to indicate whether the resource is separately eligible (S), eligible as part of a district (D), or both (B). The third digit is a number, which is coded to describe some of the circumstances or conditions of the evaluation. The general evaluation categories are as follows:

⁵ *National Register Bulletin #15*, p. 7.

⁶ Public Resources Code Section 5024.1.

⁷ Public Resources Code Section 4852.

⁸ Public Resources Code Section 5024.1.

1. Listed in the National Register or the California Register.
2. Determined eligible for listing in the National Register or the California Register.
3. Appears eligible for listing in the National Register or the California Register through survey evaluation.
4. Appears eligible for listing in the National Register or the California Register through other evaluation.
5. Recognized as historically significant by local government.
6. Not eligible for listing or designation as specified.
7. Not evaluated or needs re-evaluation.

City of Los Angeles Cultural Heritage Ordinance

The Los Angeles City Council adopted the Cultural Heritage Ordinance in 1962 and amended it in 2007 (Sections 22.171 et. seq. of the Administrative Code). The Ordinance created a Cultural Heritage Commission and criteria for designating Historic-Cultural Monuments. The Commission is comprised of five citizens, appointed by the Mayor, who have exhibited knowledge of Los Angeles history, culture and architecture. Section 22.171.7 of the Ordinance states that:

For purposes of this article, a Historic-Cultural Monument (Monument) is any site (including significant trees or other plant life located on the site), building or structure of particular historic or cultural significance to the City of Los Angeles, including historic structures or sites in which the broad cultural, economic or social history of the nation, State or community is reflected or exemplified; or which is identified with historic personages or with important events in the main currents of national, State or local history; or which embodies the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural type specimen, inherently valuable for a study of a period, style or method of construction; or a notable work of a master builder, designer, or architect whose individual genius influenced his or her age.

Unlike the National and California Registers, the Ordinance makes no mention of concepts such as physical integrity or period of significance. Moreover, properties do not have to reach a minimum age requirement, such as 50 years, to be designated as Monuments.

3. ENVIRONMENTAL SETTING

3.1 Description

Surrounding Area

The Project site is located in the City of Los Angeles. Crenshaw Boulevard, Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard, and Stocker Street are the commercial thoroughfares of the neighborhood. The predominant land use on the surrounding major streets is commercial, although there are also some multi-family residential uses as well. Low-rise commercial buildings and associated parking lots are the predominant building type on the major streets. The architecture of these buildings reflects the styles popular over the past 60 years. Some multi-family residential uses are located on the major streets,

although these residential uses are concentrated on the side streets surrounding the Project site, and are architecturally diverse.

A few properties within the Project Site boundary that are listed in the California Historic Resource Inventory System (CHRIS) have been demolished and no longer exist. 3969 Crenshaw Boulevard (the Newberry Store) and 4107 Crenshaw Boulevard (Woolworth Company) are listed as a 3S, which indicates the buildings appeared to be individually eligible for the National Register. However, these buildings were demolished in the late 1980's as part of the redevelopment of the Crenshaw Regional Mall in conjunction with the Crenshaw Redevelopment Plan. 3956 and 3964 Crenshaw Boulevard were each listed as 7R. This indicates the buildings were not evaluated. These buildings were where parking spaces and Baldwin Villa Driveway are now located. 3649 Stocker Street is listed as a 3S, which indicates the building appears eligible for listing in the National Register based on a consensus determination of the federal and state governments. However, the building now standing at this address was constructed in 1990.

Project Site

The Project site is generally located at the intersection of Crenshaw Boulevard and Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard. The Project site occupies two full blocks bounded by 39th Street to the north, Crenshaw Boulevard to the east, Stocker Street to the southeast, Santa Rosalita Drive to the southwest, and Marlton Avenue to the northwest. Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard bisects the Project site: the May Company building (now Macy's), and a shopping center are located on the portion north of Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard, and the Project site south of Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard contains the Broadway building (now Wal-Mart), an enclosed mall, the Sears building, a movie theater, and numerous freestanding commercial buildings.

The portion of the Project site north of Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard is bisected by Baldwin Villa Driveway, which runs east-west. The area south of Baldwin Villa Driveway contains the May Company building (now Macy's), and an associated parking lot north of the building. The May Company building is considered a historic resource, and is discussed in detail later in this report. The area north of Baldwin Villa Driveway contains an Albertsons grocery store and retail strip mall with an associated surface parking lot. Although the details evoke the Art Deco style, the buildings are modern and of recent construction. Building permits for the retail strip buildings and grocery store were issued in 1991. The shopping center is an ordinary example of a modern commercial shopping center oriented towards an expansive parking lot fronting the street. Thus, the buildings associated with the shopping center in this portion of Project site were eliminated as potential historic resources due to a lack of age, but also the fact that they are vernacular, modern and of recent construction.

The portion of the Project site south of Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard contains the Broadway building (now Wal-Mart), an enclosed mall, the Sears building, and various freestanding commercial buildings. The Broadway building is considered a historic resource, and is discussed in detail later in this report. The mall is connected to the May Company building by an elevated enclosed walkway over Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard. The mall is composed of two levels. Storefronts line the east and west sides of the building. On the first level, the space between the east and west storefronts forms a broad walkway. On the second level, there is a balcony on either side, forming a walkway for the west storefronts, and a walkway for the east storefront. In a somewhat symmetrical arrangement, space between the two walkways is open, creating a two-story courtyard volume to the first level. The mall building (apart from the attached Broadway building) was dismissed from further historical analysis

due to a lack of distinctive architectural features, recent construction, vernacular design as well as its age.

The Sears building is connected to the southwest corner of the mall building. The building represents a bookend to the mall complex, and is oriented towards the parking area. The building is a large, unadorned box. The single design element is the geometric-patterned window over the entrance. However, the style of the building remains vernacular, and of modern construction. As such, it was dismissed as a potential historic resource.

The Magic Johnson Theater building is located directly west of the mall building, although it is not attached to the mall. The boxy, rectangular building is of modern construction, and lacks a discernable style or theme. The movie theater was built in 1995 and is not a potential historic resource.

In addition to the Broadway building, the mall building, the Sears building, and the Magic Johnson Theater, there are numerous commercial buildings on the block south of Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard. The buildings include:

- The United One Bank building located at 4143 S. Crenshaw Blvd. (built in 1990).
- The International House of Pancakes (IHOP) building located at 3625 W. Stocker Street (built in 1955).
- A Wells Fargo Building located at 3649 W. Stocker Street (built in 1990).
- The Sizzler restaurant building located at 3701 W. Santa Rosalia Drive (built in 1989).
- A vacant restaurant building located at 3715 Santa Rosalia Drive (built in 1988).
- The Pan African Film building located at 3755 Santa Rosalia Drive (built in 1968).
- The Golden Bird restaurant building located at 3767-87 Santa Rosalia Drive (built in 1990).
- The Mattage's Bistro restaurant building located at 4090 S. Marlton Avenue (built in 1990).
- The Fatburger restaurant located at 4070 S. Marlton Avenue (built in 1995), and
- The Taco Bell fast food restaurant located at 4050 S. Marlton Avenue (built in 1989).

The buildings comprise a variety of vernacular styles of modern construction, yet many of them pay homage to the historic buildings through Art Deco and Streamline Moderne motifs, such as continuous metal overhangs, and the prevalent use of glass block, which was used in the Broadway building. All of the buildings identified above are not considered as potential historic resources due to a lack of age and/or architectural character.

3.2 Architectural Description of Historic Buildings

Broadway Building

The Broadway building is located south of Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard, and is now occupied by Wal-Mart. Its address is 4101 South Crenshaw Boulevard. The sharp angle of the intersection of

Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard and Crenshaw Boulevard influences the unusual footprint of the building. It features a fairly short frontage along Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard, and a longer frontage along Crenshaw Boulevard. The building is attached to the mall building to the west. The height of the building varies from approximately three stories in height along Crenshaw Boulevard, to approximately five stories in height along the west façade, closest to the mall building. The stepped nature of the height is emphasized in the boxy appearance of the intersecting flat rooflines.

The corner of the building fronting the intersection of Crenshaw Boulevard and Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard is the focal point for the building's ornament. The corner element is comprised of a tri-level stepped circular element, and a hanging vertical sign. The corner element stands approximately two stories higher than the three-story height of the building along Crenshaw Boulevard. The vertical sign now contains a stylized version of the Wal-Mart logo. The location of the corner detail directly faces the corner element of the May Company building, complementing the similarities between the buildings.

The primary façade along Crenshaw Boulevard features a highly stylized ground floor, and some Moderne details on the upper stories as well. The ground floor Crenshaw façade is faced in black granite tiles, broken up by metal pilasters and trim. A wide, metal canopy with horizontal grooves runs above the ground floor, supported by decorative Moderne style brackets. Circular lighting fixtures extend from the black tile façade, although it is not apparent if the lighting fixtures are original. Any remaining metal-trimmed display windows have been filled in. The upper stories of the Crenshaw Boulevard façade are occupied by asymmetrically arranged swaths of glass bricks. Long overhangs with rounded corners project over the windows, emphasizing the horizontal orientation of the windows.

The Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard façade is also highly stylized. The same ground floor design elements, such as the black tile façade and metal canopy, wrap around and continue throughout the building's north elevation. The north façade features additional metal-trimmed display windows that have been filled in. The sets of glass block windows with canopies on the second story are similar to the Crenshaw Boulevard façade. The glass blocks highlight the rounded northeast corner of the building. Glass blocks form a banded window across the entire third story of the Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard façade. The stepped nature of the rooflines is evident from this elevation, as the third story abruptly ends.

Although the detailing and orientation of the building favors the Crenshaw Boulevard elevation, the main exterior entrance is actually located on the south elevation. The same ground floor design elements such as the black tile façade and metal canopy wrap around and continue on the building's south elevation. The entrance to the store is a set of glass doors flush with an expansive display window, with metal trim. The entrance, doors, and display window do not appear original. A large stepped, geometric element is arranged above the entrance. The color scheme is teal, orange, cream, and white, juxtaposed with the red Wal-Mart logo. The geometric and color aesthetic is indicative of the Moderne style, however it is not apparent what portions of this element are original. The upper stories of the south façade are blank.

The lower stories of the west elevation of the building are completely obscured by the attached mall building. However, since the west portion of the Broadway building is taller than the mall building, the upper portion of the elevation is visible from a distance. Similar to the Crenshaw Boulevard façade, banks of glass block with expressive overhangs are arranged asymmetrically on the southern portion of the façade. Smaller, less decorative sets of glass block windows are located on the corner of the

façade. The center portion of the façade features a square cut-out pattern on the façade, and a similar cut-out pattern on the northern portion of the façade. The exterior of the building has clearly been altered over time, and it is difficult to pinpoint the myriad minor alterations in the building permit record.

The interior of the Broadway building has been completely remodeled to accommodate Wal-Mart. Virtually no historic fabric remains. According to the building permit records, the interior partition walls, load bearing walls, and many minor interior alterations have occurred since construction. The building was affected by the extensive development that took place in 1988-1989 to add an enclosed mall to the rear of the Broadway building. The original volume of the building interior would have been very similar to the May Company building, with a grand ground floor, and modest upper floors. The vestiges of the first-floor volume remain, with high ceilings and some narrow, plain columns visible. However, all of the materials, such as the floors, walls, ceiling, and lighting, are all modern materials, and are not original. The upper floors feature drop ceilings, and similar modern floors, walls, ceilings, and lighting. Most of the columns on the upper floors are obscured by partition walls and displays. Similar to the May Company building, the second floor of the Broadway building accesses the mall through a large, modern walkway. The escalator shaft appears to be modern and not original. However, a review of relevant building permits did not reveal major alterations to the escalator mechanisms or shaft. Notwithstanding the escalator shaft, it is evident the the interior has been stripped of all of its original features and finishes.

May Company Building

The May Company building is located north of Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard, and is now occupied by Macy's. Its address is 4005 Crenshaw Boulevard. It is attached to the mall building by an elevated walkway over Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard. The building is plain in the sense that the upper floors are not fenestrated, and the primary visible material is concrete plaster scored into a grid pattern. However, the asymmetric and curvilinear shape of the building, the highly ornamental detail and materials along the ground floor primary elevations, and the use of stepped shapes define the building's Moderne style.

Due to the sharp angle of the intersection of Martin Luther King Jr. and Crenshaw Boulevards, the shape of the May Company building is unusual. The footprint of the building mirrors the intersection, and is thus somewhat triangular. However, while the footprint of the building mirrors the blunt triangular shape of the site, the corners of the building are rounded. While the department store contains three interior levels, the building is approximately four stories in height. The height of the building is slightly stepped, as the centermost portion of the building is slightly taller than the building along the street facades. The stepped roofline is only visible along the north elevation; otherwise the roof is flat.

The corner of the building facing the intersection of Crenshaw and Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevards is the focal point of the building. While all of the corners of the building are gently rounded, the corner at the intersection is an even broader curve. A four-level colonnade emphasizes the rounded corner. Rectangular, vertical hanging signs are positioned on either side of the corner, however these signs are now blank. The facades of the building juxtapose the plain upper stories with the stylized elements of the ground floor. The upper portion of the facades on all sides of the building are faced with concrete plaster scored into a grid pattern. On the upper stories, this pattern is occasionally interrupted by HVAC vents on each floor. The stylized portions of the ground floor facades are

concentrated on the Crenshaw Boulevard (east) and parking lot (west) facades. These portions of the ground floor façade are faced in black terrazzo.

Raised boxy display windows are arranged on black terrazzo pedestals. On the west façade, there are also original floor-to-ceiling display windows with terrazzo bulkheads and metal trim. The displays are interspersed with ground floor planters with mature landscaping. The displays that remain are original, although some display windows have evidently been removed, as they are covered with a solid light grey material. Entrances are recessed, with glass doors flush with floor-to-ceiling glass windows with metal trim. The doors do not appear to be original, and the entrance on the Crenshaw Boulevard elevation is inaccessible. A wide canopy runs along both the east and west facades, and around the corners. The metal fascia of the canopy provides a contrast to the scored concrete façade above. The soffit and canopy lighting is not original or distinctive. It is evident from the texture of the plaster that there were originally long rectangular windows above the canopy that have been filled.

The north and south elevations are secondary elevations, as they do not include the same level of detail as the east and west-facing elevations. The façade on the north side is differentiated by the black terrazzo running along the entire ground floor façade. The rest of the north façade is blank, except for the upper-story vents. The south façade is almost completely obscured by the walkway over Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard to the enclosed mall. This south façade has virtually no details.

The building is still used as a department store. The ground floor is the most intact portion of the interior. The striking feature about the ground floor is the volume of the space; the entire space is open, with no partitions. Narrow, plain columns are symmetrically arranged throughout the space to provide support to the building. The height of the ceiling and the finish appear original, although the recessed round lighting fixtures are not. The interior walls do not appear to be original or particularly distinctive. However, the oversized Moderne clock located directly above the main entrance appears to be original and is in good condition. The flooring is inconsistent and includes a combination of carpet and tile. Some portions of the tile appear original, while other portions do not. The escalators are located in the center of the building. Modern escalators typically feature a single boxy column that house both directions of the escalator. However, the subject escalators are two separate shafts. There is an abstract geometric pattern on at least one of the shafts.

The second and third floors of the building are much plainer than the first floor. Both floors feature a modest drop ceiling, modern lighting, and the same combination of flooring material discussed above. The original, plain columns run from the ground floor to the third-floor. On all floors, the columns are exposed. The second floor features an open plan similar to the ground floor. The areas surrounding the escalator shafts feature an overhanging partition element suspended from the ceiling. Due to the Moderne style, the element is likely original. The second floor also includes the large opening onto the walkway over Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard and to the mall.

The third floor contains the most apparent alterations, as the open floor plan has been eliminated. Floor-to-ceiling partition walls subdivide the floor into different spaces. The existing Macy's store only occupies a portion of the third floor. Approximately one-third of the floor contains merchandise, a portion is presumably used for other Macy's uses (but is not open to the public), and a portion of the floor is occupied by The Museum of African Art.

The May Company building has undergone major and minor alterations since construction. Building permits indicate numerous changes to the partition walls in the interior of the building, including load-bearing and non load-bearing walls. This type of partition alteration occurred soon after construction of the building, (1945), and continued up to the current day, as the third floor partitions appear to

have been re-arranged recently. The building permit records indicate the major alterations occurred in the 1960s, as the basement was remodeled, and the first floor coffee shop was remodeled. It is important to note the first floor coffee shop no longer exists. It is unknown when the coffee shop was removed. In 1965, more interior partitions were altered on the second and third floors. In 1972, the rolling service doors at the four entrances were added, signifying the current entrances are not wholly original. The building was affected by the extensive development that took place in 1988-1989 to add an enclosed mall to the rear of the Broadway building, and the bridge structure over Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard to the May Company; permits indicate this included the construction of a plaster exterior wall, presumably in connection with the bridge construction.⁹

3.3 History and Significance

The Project site is located in the Baldwin Hills area of the City of Los Angeles. The area is named after 19th century horse racing pioneer E.J. "Lucky" Baldwin, who obtained the land in 1875 and owned it until his death in 1909. Baldwin's heirs, Anita Baldwin and Clara Baldwin Stocker, controlled the land for the next 25 years. In the 1920s, large oil fields were discovered in the area. Following the discovery, industrial development and residential housing for oil laborers became a feature of the Baldwin Hills landscape. Despite the influx of the oil industry, much of the area remained predominantly rural until the 1930s when significant subdivisions occurred. Rapid population growth and the rising popularity of the automobile resulted in suburban development in the area. Hundreds of houses and apartment complexes were built in the late 1930s and 1940s, creating a regional area of medium density multi-family housing.

The J. W. Broadway department store was founded in 1896 by Arthur Letts, an English immigrant, who purchased a bankrupt store in downtown Los Angeles at Broadway and 4th Street, which was named after the street it faced.¹⁰ After World War II, major department stores based in downtown Los Angeles started opening up branches. Broadway expanded, along with the competition, Bullock's and the May Company. Broadway had already purchased the Dyas Hollywood store in 1931 and opened a store in Pasadena in 1940 before it decided to open a branch in Baldwin Hills.¹¹ Rapid suburban development in Baldwin Hills resulted in the need for modern commercial services. Broadway board chairman James Lamb chose the site because 567,000 residents were within a 20 minutes' drive of the site, yet there were no department stores in Baldwin Hills.¹² A survey also indicated that the district would have a population boom.¹³

In 1944, land was leased by Broadway Department Store Inc. (Broadway) from Baldwin and Stocker as the site for a new department store and several smaller buildings. A portion of the more than 35-acre site was a part of Sunset Fields Golf Course.¹⁴ For the department store, the company planned a three-story, stainless steel and black granite exterior building surrounded by a plaza for pedestrian and car use, and a service tunnel under the paved area for trucks.¹⁵ The air-conditioned interior had

⁹ City of Los Angeles Building Permits, various dates.

¹⁰ Teresa Grimes, *Historic Resources Report: Valley and Laurel Plaza Shopping Centers*. February 1, 2007, 17.

¹¹ Richard Longstreth, *City Center to Regional Mall*. Cambridge: MIT Press, 1997, 226.

¹² "Broadway Opening," *Time*, website: <http://www.time.com/time/magazine/article/0,9171,934176-1,00.html>, December 8, 1947, p. 1. This was one of the first site selection studies that used detailed information from the 1940 census that included time-distance research (where the audience lived and how long would a drive to the site would be). For more information see Longstreth, 228-229.

¹³ "Broadway Begins Store in Southwest Section" in *Los Angeles Times*, October 30, 1945, p. 6.

¹⁴ "Broadway Store Leases Site for New Building" in *Los Angeles Times*, October 17, 1944, p. n.a.

¹⁵ "Broadway Begins Store in Southwest Section," p. 6.

Tennessee marble on the ground floor (except in the “more intimate” departments which had carpet like the other two floors). The third floor had executive offices, a beauty salon, a cafeteria for employees, and an auditorium.¹⁶ The building had two identical facades, one facing the street and one facing the parking lot.¹⁷ The parking lot in the back was 13 acres with spaces for 2,500 cars.

The Broadway also selected the retail stores for the smaller buildings in the shopping center and ensured that the stores were fully integrated to suit the needs of the Broadway department store. The Broadway targeted the budget-conscious clientele and chose mainly chain-owned outlets, instead of independent specialty stores.¹⁸ The stores paid rent to the Broadway in fees estimated to be equal to the amount Broadway paid in rent for its own store.¹⁹

The architect Albert B. Gardner, who also designed the Broadway store in Pasadena, designed the Broadway-Crenshaw Center in the Streamline Moderne style. He also designed the Buck Jones House (1937) in Sherman Oaks. After visiting the Pasadena store and observing its poor floor layout and outdated sales fixtures, the Executive Vice President of Broadway Department Store, Inc. Edward W. Carter redesigned the Crenshaw store. He hired the famous industrial design firm Raymond Loewy Associates to carry out his ideas, including building a 7,000 square foot roof sundeck for employees.²⁰

The Project site was originally designed in 1945 as the Broadway-Crenshaw Center and it opened November 1947. Next to the Broadway department store and to its south was a Woolworth’s Variety store. Along Crenshaw Boulevard (in order going south) were stores for children’s clothes, women’s clothes, shoes, fabrics, men’s clothes, a cafeteria, women’s accessories and a drugstore. A Vons supermarket, bank, and drugstore lined Santa Barbara Avenue (now Martin Luther King, Jr.).²¹ The stores had a wide, continuous overhang with store signs hung at right angles to storefronts.²² Including the retail, the center covered nearly 550,000 square feet: the Broadway department store was 208,000 square feet, Woolworth’s variety store over 48,000 square feet, and Vons supermarket 45,000 square feet.

A two-story office building for Pacific Telephone and Telegraph Co. was built on the corner of Stocker and Angelus Drive (now Santa Rosalia Drive). It was next to the entrance to the service tunnel and the exit for the tunnel was parallel to Marlton Avenue. A distinctive gas station was built on the corner of Angelus Vista and Marlton Avenue for the shoppers and residents nearby to get gas. Designed by Albert B. Gardner and Wolfe and Thormin, associates, the gas station was marked by a tall, neon-lit pylon in the middle of a circular glass-walled section. The roof overhang around the glass-walled section was lit on the underside by concentric lines of white neon and the station had a rectangular wing that housed services, such as car washing.²³

The Vons supermarket on Santa Barbara Avenue (now Martin Luther King, Jr.) was next to the rear parking area entrance and across from the Broadway department store. Architect Stiles Clements designed it with display windows on three sides (Santa Barbara Avenue, rear parking area, and the access road).

¹⁶ Ibid.

¹⁷ Longstreth, p. 235.

¹⁸ Longstreth, p. 231.

¹⁹ Longstreth, p. 232.

²⁰ “Broadway Opening,” p. 1.

²¹ Geoffrey Baker and Bruno Funaro, *Shopping Centers*, New York: Reinhold Publishing Corporation, 1951, p. 176.

²² Baker and Funaro, p. 176.

²³ Baker and Funaro, p. 178.

In 1877, David May opened a small tailor shop and clothing store. By 1946, the May Company had become a chain of seven department stores in Akron, St. Louis, Baltimore, Cleveland, Denver, and Los Angeles.²⁴ The May Company chose to open a single store in Baldwin Hills at the corner of Santa Barbara Avenue (now Martin Luther King, Jr.) and Crenshaw Boulevard. It was part of the company's major expansion effort that included a new five-story store in Hollywood, an addition to the May Company store on Wilshire Boulevard and Fairfax Avenue, modernization of their downtown store at Broadway and 8th Street (originally the A. Hamburger & Sons building), and construction of a six-story service and distribution building at Jefferson Street and Grand Avenue. The site was leased from G.D. Rovertson Sr. and G.D. Rovertson Jr in 1945.²⁵

The architect for the May Company building was Albert C. Martin and Associates. Born in 1879, Albert Carey Martin received his architectural and engineering degree from University of Illinois, Champaign-Urbana. He started his own firm, A. C. Martin, in 1906. He worked as an associate architect on the A. Hamburger & Sons Building (1907), which later became the May Company's downtown store. He also, with Samuel Marx, designed the iconic May Company building on Wilshire Boulevard (1939-40).²⁶ Albert C. Martin Jr., an architect, and J. Edward Martin, a structural engineer, joined their father's firm in 1945 and the company was renamed Albert C. Martin and Associates.²⁷ The firm was responsible for several notable buildings in Los Angeles, such as the Department of Water and Power (1965), the Union Bank (1968), and Arco Towers (1963).²⁸

The three-story, reinforced concrete and fireproof building stood on a seven-acre site with six acres for a paved parking area. The steel and concrete building was 263,760 square feet. The main entrances were on Crenshaw Boulevard and the parking lot had room for 750 cars. On the street-level, the windows gave an almost complete view of interior, except where there were displays.²⁹ On each of three floors facing the street intersection were tiered round galleries planted with shrubbery and greenery. The interior had wide aisles and cove-type lighting. On the main floor's north side was a 160-seat coffee shop for customers. The basement housed an auditorium for 300, dressing rooms, and a runway for fashion shows. There was a playroom with circus motifs and a barbershop with toys for the children.³⁰ At the opening ceremony on October 10, 1947, Vice-President of the May Company stores, Tom May, the grandson of the founder, said the store was "created expressly for the residents of the Crenshaw area."³¹

The combination of the Broadway-Crenshaw Center and the May Company department store generated a lot of traffic that surpassed the expectations of the Broadway and May Company executives. The two stores were fierce competitors, but most customers were unaware that the May Company store was developed apart from the center and assumed the development was done

²⁴ Phil King, "May Company," *Final Report of Year III Historical and Cultural Resources Survey of Los Angeles: Sylmar, Watts, Crenshaw, and Vermont/Slauson*, 1983, continuation sheet #2.

²⁵ "May Co. to Build Two New Stores in \$10,000,000 Expansion Program" in *Los Angeles Times*, June 7, 1945, p. 6.

²⁶ Alan Michelson, "Albert Carey Martin, Senior," *ArchitectDB*, website: <https://digital.lib.washington.edu/php/architect/record.phtml?type=architect&architectid=105>, accessed July 29, 2008.

²⁷ Ibid.

²⁸ Grimes, p. 20-21.

²⁹ "Opening Set Tomorrow for May Co. Crenshaw" in *Los Angeles Times*, October 9, 1947.

³⁰ Ibid.

³¹ "New May Co. Crenshaw Store Will Open Today" in *Los Angeles Times*, October 10, 1947, p. A1.

together.³² In later years, the May Company added a group of stores. The department stores and nearby retail businesses became a major shopping “district” that competed with the one downtown.³³

The Broadway-Crenshaw Center was one of the first regional shopping centers in the United States. At the time it was built, it was part of a new trend of adding large supermarkets and department stores to commercial strips. Commercial strips were being transformed into automobile-centered plazas arranged in a unified plan rather than a group of independent stores. As a result, the popular term “Shopping Center” emerged to describe commercial sites built for the automobile. Previously, large department stores were constructed along commercial strips and in close proximity to central urban cores.

The Broadway-Crenshaw Center pioneered several features of regional shopping centers that, because of its success, were widely imitated. It was the first large complex that consisted of a department store anchoring integrated retail.³⁴ Nothing like it had been built before and a retail center with paired departments stores was never done before either.³⁵ Setting a precedent, the Broadway and its commercial broker, Coldwell Banker, arranged for a mix of tenants. Before, only real estate developers initiated and controlled retail development.³⁶ The tunnel underneath the center for deliveries was followed in later shopping malls. Before, parking lots were used for delivery vehicles, packages, and trash bins, which made them unsightly as customer entrances.³⁷ The Broadway embraced the parking lot, having a large one though it was behind the store. This influenced the design of Valley Plaza shopping center in North Hollywood (1951), which had large department stores anchor the development and a prominent parking lot.³⁸

The integrity of the Project site as a whole was affected by the extensive development that took place in 1988-89. The development included both the Broadway-Crenshaw Center as well as the May Company site, and the entire retail complex was renamed the Baldwin Hills Crenshaw Plaza. The enclosed mall was added to the rear of the Broadway building, and the bridge over Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard connecting the Broadway building to the May Company building was built. To build the multi-level parking garage and parking lot, the buildings that were Woolworth’s and housed the other stores were demolished. The Broadway eventually became Wal-Mart. The May Company building eventually became Macy’s.

As previously stated, the Broadway building was evaluated as 3S, or appears eligible for listing in the National Register. The interior was gutted for Wal-Mart in 2003-04. Based on an assessment of the current state of the building’s integrity, the Broadway building is no longer eligible for listing in the National Register, but would remain eligible for listing in the California Register. The expected level of integrity is slightly lower for the California Register than the National Register. Therefore, the building would continue to be considered a historic resource subject to CEQA. The May Company building was evaluated as 2S2, or formally determined eligible for listing in the National Register. Properties formally determined eligible for listing in the National Register are automatically included in the California Register. While the building may no longer be eligible for listing in the National Register given the alterations, it retains sufficient integrity for listing in the California Register. Therefore it is a

³² Longstreth, p. 237.

³³ Ibid.

³⁴ Longstreth, p. 230-231.

³⁵ Longstreth, p. 236-7.

³⁶ Longstreth, p. 232.

³⁷ Longstreth, p. 235.

³⁸ Grimes, p. 4.

historic resource subject to CEQA. The buildings are eligible for listing as Los Angeles Historic-Cultural Monuments for the same reasons they are eligible for listing in the California Register.

4. PROJECT IMPACTS

4.1 Determining the Significance of Impacts on Historical Resources

In enacting the California Register, the Legislature amended CEQA to clarify which properties are significant, as well as which project impacts are considered to be significantly adverse.

A project that may cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of a historical resource is a project that may have a significant effect on the environment.³⁹

A substantial adverse change means demolition, destruction, relocation, or alteration of the resource such that the significance of a historical resource is materially impaired.⁴⁰

The State CEQA Guidelines include a slightly different definition of "substantial adverse change:"

Substantial adverse change in the significance of a historical resource means physical demolition, destruction, relocation, or alteration of the resource or its immediate surroundings such that the significance of a historical resource is materially impaired.⁴¹

The Guidelines go on to state that "the significance of a historic resource is materially impaired when a project demolishes or materially alters in an adverse manner those physical characteristics that convey its significance and that justify its inclusion in or eligibility for inclusion in the California Register, local register, or its identification in a historic resources survey."⁴²

The following factors are set forth in the City of Los Angeles' "L.A. CEQA Thresholds Guide," which states that a project would normally have a significant impact on historic resources if it would result in a substantial adverse change in the significance of a historic resource. A substantial adverse change in significance occurs if the project involves:

- Demolition of a significant resource;
- Relocation that does not maintain the integrity and (historical/architectural) significance of a significant resource;
- Conversion, rehabilitation, or alteration of a significant resource which does not conform to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings; or
- Construction that reduces the integrity or significance of important resources on the site or in the vicinity.

³⁹ Public Resource Code Section 21084.1.

⁴⁰ Public Resource Code Section 5020.1(q).

⁴¹ 14 CCR Section 15064.5(b)(2)(A).

⁴² 14 CCR Section 15064.5(b)(2).

4.2 Secretary of the Interior's Standards

Projects, which may affect historic resources, are considered to be mitigated to a level of less than significant, if they conform to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.⁴³ Projects with no other potential impacts qualify for a Class 31 exemption under CEQA if they meet the Standards.⁴⁴ The Standards were issued by the National Park Service. They were not intended to be prescriptive, but to "...promote responsible preservation practices that help protect our Nation's irreplaceable cultural resources."⁴⁵ The Standards are accompanied by Guidelines for four types of treatments for historic buildings: Preservation, Rehabilitation, Restoration, and Reconstruction.

The definition of rehabilitation assumes that at least some repair or alteration of the historic building will be needed in order to provide for an efficient contemporary use; however these repairs and alterations must not damage or destroy materials, features or finishes that are important in defining the building's historic character.

The Standards are as follows:

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
4. Changes to a property that have acquired significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.

⁴³ 14 CCR Section 15126.4(b).

⁴⁴ 14 CCR Section 15331.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The primary application of the Standards is in connection with approval of rehabilitation work for the 20% federal rehabilitation tax credit. Projects only receive the 20% credit if they meet the Standards. The State Office of Historic Preservation reviews tax credit projects and the National Park Service makes the final certification.

4.3 Project Impacts

The Project involves the redevelopment of the Baldwin Hills Crenshaw Plaza. The mixed-use project will include, retail, commercial, office, hotel, and residential uses totaling up to approximately 3,435,726 square feet of developed floor area, which will be constructed in phases. The existing mall site is developed with approximately 997,609 square feet of retail, restaurant, office, and entertainment uses. The Broadway and May Company buildings will be preserved and incorporated into the Project. The Broadway building would become the main entrance to the mall. The first two levels of the interior would be open and used for circulation. The original display windows on the exterior that have been enclosed would be reopened. Two small retail buildings would be constructed on Crenshaw Boulevard, in front of the May Company building. There are no specific plans for the rehabilitation of the buildings at this time, therefore they may be impacted by inappropriate alterations that further degrade their integrity.

4.4 Mitigation Measures

CEQA requires the Lead Agency to examine and impose mitigation measures that would avoid or minimize any impacts or potential impacts to historic resources. The following mitigation measures are recommended:

1. Alterations to the two historic resources shall comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment for Historic Properties (Standards).
2. The exterior of the two historic resources should be restored to the extent feasible.
2. A qualified historic preservation consultant shall monitor the design and construction of the Project as it relates to historic resources to ensure that it complies with the Standards. The consultant shall prepare a report at the conclusion of the design and development phase of the Project analyzing compliance with the Standards. That report shall be submitted to the City of Los Angeles Office of Historic Resources for its

⁴⁵ U.S. Department of the Interior, Factors to Consider When Selecting An Appropriate Treatment, website: http://www.nps.gov/history/HPS/hli/landscape_guidelines/factors.htm, January 28, 2008.

review and approval. The consultant shall monitor the construction of the Project periodically.

4.5 Impacts on Historic Resources after Mitigation

The mitigation measures above would reduce the potential impacts associated with historic resources to a less than significant level.

5. SOURCES

Baker, Geoffrey and Bruno Funaro, *Shopping Centers*. New York: Reinhold Publishing Corporation, 1951.

City of Los Angeles Building Permits, various dates.

Grimes, Teresa, *Historic Resources Report: Valley and Laurel Plaza Shopping Centers*. February 1, 2007.

King, Phil, "May Company, "Final Report of Year III Historical and Cultural Resources Survey of Los Angeles: Sylmar, Watts, Crenshaw, and Vermont/Slauson. 1983.

Longstreth, Richard. *City Center to Regional Mall*. Cambridge: MIT Press, 1997.

Michelson, Alan, "Albert Carey Martin, Senior." *ArchitectDB*. Website:
<https://digital.lib.washington.edu/php/architect/record.phtml?type=architect&architectid=105>,
accessed July 29, 2008.

-----"Stiles Oliver Clements," *ArchitectDB*. Website:
<https://digital.lib.washington.edu/php/architect/record.phtml?type=architect&architectid=116>,
accessed July 29, 2008.

No Author, "Broadway Begins Store in Southwest Section," *Los Angeles Times*, October 30, 1945, p. 6.

No Author, "Broadway Opening," *Time*, website:
<http://www.time.com/time/magazine/article/0,9171,934176-1,00.html>, December 8, 1947, p. 1-2.

No Author, "Broadway Store Leases Site for New Building," *Los Angeles Times*, October 17, 1944, p. n.a.

No Author, "Crenshaw Plaza Breaks Ground," *Los Angeles Times*, October 19, 1986, p. I14.

No Author. "May Co. to Build Two New Stores in \$10,000,000 Expansion Program," *Los Angeles Times*, June 7, 1945, p. 6.

No Author, "May's Crenshaw Store Opens with Ceremony," *Los Angeles Times*, October 11, 1947, p. A1.

No Author, "New May Co. Crenshaw Store Will Open Today," *Los Angeles Times*, October 10, 1947, p. A1.

No Author, "Opening Set Tomorrow for May Co. Crenshaw," *Los Angeles Times*, October 9, 1947, p. n.a.

No Author, "View of May Co. Store on Crenshaw Unveiled," *Los Angeles Times*, June 23, 1945, p. 2.

Schoenherr, Steven E. "Suburban Center," *Evolution of the Shopping Center*, website:
<http://history.sandiego.edu/gen/soc/shoppingcenter.html>, February 17, 2006.